

American Musicological Society

Southern Chapter

Annual Meeting



9–10 February 2007

Baton Rouge

Louisiana State University

PROGRAM

Friday 8:30–10:00 • **Raisons d'être: How Things Come to Be**

Alison MacFarland (Louisiana State University), Chair

“Music for Louis d’Anjou”

Alice V. Clark (Loyola University)

“Crotch’s *Specimens* and the Ideology of the Canon”

Howard Irving (University of Alabama at Birmingham)

“Henry Cowell’s Role in Developing and Disseminating ‘Dissonant Counterpoint’”

John D. Spilker (Florida State University)

10:00–10:15 • **Break**

Friday 10:15–11:45 • **Problems and Possibilities in Performance Practice: The Score and Beyond**

Linda Cummins (University of Alabama), Chair

“‘Lichtmusik’ and ‘Orgies of Darkness’: Balancing the Aural
and the Visual in the 1903 Mahler-Roller *Tristan*”

Stephen Thursby (Florida State University)

“The Sound of the Present-Day Prepared Piano”

Tina Huettenrauch (Louisiana State University)

“The Performance Tradition of Berio’s *Circles*”

Amy Strickland (University of Alabama)

11:45–1:30 • **Lunch**

Friday 1:30–2:30 • **Taking a Second Look**

Gregory W. Harwood (Georgia Southern University), Chair

“A Reappraisal of Bertali’s Instrumental Compositions”

Charles E. Brewer (Florida State University)

“‘With All Pomposity and Solemnity’: Music, Ritual and the Reevaluation
of Baroque Aesthetics in Religious Culture of New Spain”

Jesús A. Ramos-Kittrell (New College of Florida)

Friday 2:35–3:35 • Italian Opera: Behind the Scenes

Scott Warfield (University of Central Florida), Chair

“Vicente Martín y Soler’s Operas for Turin: Elements of Production
and Ensemble Writing in *Andromaca* (1780) and *Vologeso* (1783)”

Margaret R. Butler (University of Alabama)

“New Letters from Scribe to Verdi and the ‘Problem’ of the Fifth Act of *Les Vêpres siciliennes*”

Andreas Giger (Louisiana State University)

3:35–3:55 • Break

Friday 3:55–4:55 • Musical Manifestations of Britain’s Heroes

Valerie Goertzen (Loyola University), Chair

“Dryden’s *King Arthur* on the Opera Stage”

Lisi Oliver (Louisiana State University)

“Vaughan Williams’s *Scott of the Antarctic* and *Sinfonia Antartica*: A Problem of Ambiguity”

Aaron Keebaugh (University of Florida)

Friday 5:00–6:00 • Local Colors: Two Views from California

Douglass Seaton (Florida State University), Chair

“Ernest Bloch in San Francisco”

David Z. Kushner (University of Florida)

“Perspectives on Jim Morrison from the Underground: Jim Morrison and the *Los Angeles Free Press*”

Melissa Ursula Dawn Goldsmith (Nicholls State University)

Saturday 8:30–9:30 • Business Meeting

Saturday 9:30–11:00 • Local Colors: Putting Music in Its Place

David Z. Kushner (University of Florida), Chair

“Pilgrim’s Pride?: Edgar Stillman Kelley’s ‘New England’ Symphony (1913)”

Charles Freeman (Palm Beach Atlantic University)

“After the Show: The Intimate Revue in London’s West End from 1945 to 1955”

Rebecca Burkart (North Florida Community College)

“Music in the New Orleans Disapora”

Stella Baty Landis (Tulane University)

Saturday 11:00–11:15 • Break

Saturday 11:15–1:15 • Thinking Classically: Structure and Kinship

Jan Herlinger (Louisiana State University), Chair

“Formal Innovation in Haydn’s Mature Piano Trios (Hob. XV: 5–32)”

James S. MacKay (Loyola University)

“A Reevaluation of ‘Significant’ Thematic Relationships in the Classical Era”

Bryan Proksch (McNeese State University)

“Beethoven Thinking About Cycles: Some Consequences”

Joanna Cobb Biermann (University of Alabama)

“Franz Schubert, Caspar David Friedrich, and the Impossible Landscape”

Edward Hafer (University of Southern Mississippi)

ABSTRACTS

Friday 8:30–10:00 • **Raisons d’être: How Things Come to Be** Alison MacFarland (Louisiana State University), Chair

“Music for Louis d’Anjou”
Alice V. Clark (Loyola University)

Charles V, Philippe of Burgundy, Jean of Berry—these are names well known for their vibrant courts. Their appreciation of music would have come not only through the French royal line, but also from their mother, Bonne of Luxembourg, for whom Guillaume de Machaut’s first complete-works manuscript may have been intended. Scarcely less important than these three, though, is their brother Louis, first member of the “Second Angevin House,” the fourteenth- and fifteenth-century dukes of Anjou. This line, descended from French kings and claiming the crowns of Sicily and Jerusalem as well as the county of Provence, survived for a little over a century, a time largely filled with unsuccessful attempts to conquer Naples. Nevertheless, they had opportunities to patronize the arts: for example, Louis I commissioned the Apocalypse tapestry now visible in Angers, and René was an author in his own right. Moreover, this family’s existence is bracketed by their employment of two important composers: Matheus de Sancto Johanne in the 1370s and Josquin des Pres in the 1470s. Louis’s association with the visual arts is clearer than is his interest in music, with relatively little surviving documentation concerning his musical activities, but evidence exists both of wages paid to musicians and songs and motets that may refer to him or members of his family. This suggests that Louis, like his brothers, may also have enjoyed music—or at least that he knew how to use it in support of his political goals.

“Crotch’s *Specimens* and the Ideology of the Canon”
Howard Irving (University of Alabama at Birmingham)

The Norfolk Record Office holds a manuscript notebook from the early 1830s that contains the earliest known syllabus for a music history survey course. This syllabus is of interest because recent research has identified England as the origin of the notion of “classical music” and of a canon of accepted masterworks, and the early nineteenth century remains an unfinished chapter in that concept’s evolution. The syllabus uses as a text William Crotch’s *Specimens of Various Styles of Music Referred to in a Course of Lectures Read at Oxford and London* (London, ca. 1807), the first historical anthology of music. The particular works selected for any teaching anthology necessarily betray an ideological starting point that may not be openly admitted, and Crotch’s *Specimens* are revealing in this regard. Prior to the *Specimens*, Crotch’s most significant contribution to establishing the canon was his definition of the genre “ancient music” in terms of its effect on the listener, abandoning the traditional definition based instead on the age of the music. In the *Specimens*, Crotch implicitly takes on the issues of a work’s popularity and audience appeal. He does this by deliberately selecting unspectacular and lesser known works, avoiding more obvious choices such as Haydn’s London symphonies. A strategy of defining the canon in terms of the effort required to appreciate it is acknowledged in Crotch’s public lectures and has been identified as a component of the ideology of the earlier Concert of Ancient Music.

“Henry Cowell’s Role in Developing and Disseminating ‘Dissonant Counterpoint’”
John D. Spilker (Florida State University)

Scholarly opinion credits Charles Seeger with creating “dissonant counterpoint,” a compositional practice used by several American ultramodern composers that involves prepared and resolved consonances within a dissonant framework. This theory reverses the Fuxian approach to counterpoint, in which dissonances are prepared and resolved within a consonant structure. However, the development of dissonant counterpoint also involved the efforts of other composers, namely Henry Cowell and Ruth Crawford. As a result, its ownership is difficult to attribute to one person. While Nancy Rao has demonstrated Crawford’s active involvement in the process of developing dissonant counterpoint, little research has been done to understand Cowell’s role. This paper will reassess Henry Cowell’s vital contribution to the development and dissemination of dissonant counterpoint. Furthermore, tracing dissonant counterpoint’s dissemination and use reveals it to be the product of a more complex cultural milieu than that of a single individual.

Seeger claims to have developed dissonant counterpoint as a classroom discipline for modern composition methods while teaching private lessons to Cowell at the University of California at Berkeley in 1914. However, Ann Pescatello sheds light on this situation, explaining that Cowell’s lessons with Seeger occurred while Seeger was just

beginning to develop a compositional system for using dissonance. This information calls into question the extent to which Seeger had developed dissonant counterpoint prior to his meetings with Cowell. In fact, the term dissonant counterpoint may suggest more specificity and rigor than actually existed in the original idea. In addition, Pescatello notes that Seeger viewed Cowell more as a colleague than a student. Therefore, it is probable that these two musicians worked out the beginnings of dissonant counterpoint together.

After leaving Berkeley in 1918, Seeger abandoned dissonant counterpoint, and he did not revisit the theory until over ten years later when he began teaching it to Ruth Crawford in 1929. During this same decade, Cowell had been teaching dissonant counterpoint and writing about it in his book, *New Musical Resources* (completed in 1919), and in a 1928 article, "New Terms for New Music." Seeger's lessons with Crawford re-ignited his interest in dissonant counterpoint and in 1930 he published an overview of the theory. Judith Tick has suggested that Seeger may have published this article as a reaction to the publication of Cowell's *New Musical Resources* in 1930 and in an effort to claim his intellectual property. With the help and encouragement of Crawford, Seeger worked on the larger "Manual of Dissonant Counterpoint" but he never published the book. This is ironic considering that Seeger impressed upon Cowell the importance of the scholar disseminating his or her own ideas. Cowell's extensive involvement as a musical agent for dissonant counterpoint invites a reexamination of his role in the development and dissemination of this theory.

Friday 10:15–11:45 • Problems and Possibilities in Performance Practice: The Score and Beyond

Linda Cummins (University of Alabama), Chair

"'Lichtmusik' and 'Orgies of Darkness': Balancing
the Aural and the Visual in the 1903 Mahler-Roller *Tristan*"
Stephen Thursby (Florida State University)

The historic 1903 production of Richard Wagner's *Tristan und Isolde* at the Vienna Court Opera was the first major collaboration between Gustav Mahler and the Secession artist Alfred Roller. Roller's expressive use of light and color modernized the visual element of Wagner productions and also invigorated critical debates about the relative importance of music and stage spectacle in the Wagnerian *Gesamtkunstwerk*. Many critics blended aural and visual terminology in describing elements of the staging as "light-music" (*Lichtmusik*) or "painted Tristan-music" (*gemalte Tristanmusik*), while others criticized the visual elements for drawing audience attention away from the music. Franz Willnauer and Wolfgang Greisenegger have suggested the possible influence of Swiss stage reformer Adolphe Appia on Roller's use of light and space on the stage. In this paper, I delve further into Appia and Roller's conceptions of the expressive role of light and darkness in the staging of *Tristan*.

In his 1898 treatise *La Musique et la mise en scène*, Appia rejected theatrical naturalism and the desire for scenic illusion accomplished through painted scenery. Wagner, in spite of his musical and dramaturgical innovations, neglected to reform the visual presentation of his music dramas, favoring a naturalistic style that dominated productions at Bayreuth for many years. Appia advocated a simplification of stage presentation and the use of light and three-dimensional stage space to create appropriate atmosphere. Light was Appia's most expressive visual element, and shadows and darkness also played a major role in his visual conception. In a proposal for a staging of *Tristan*, Appia explicitly detailed changing light conditions within specific scenes. In acts 2 and 3, darkness would dominate much of the stage space.

As a visual artist, Roller used light and color more creatively in the 1903 *Tristan* than Appia had previously suggested in his proposal. Roller's use of light and fundamental colors (*Grundtöne*) for each act was duly noted by contemporary journalists. Darkness, exemplified by a brilliant star-filled backdrop, prevailed in his act 2 love duet staging. Some critics dismissed his visual style as "orgies of darkness." In a letter first published last year by Willnauer, the singer Anna von Mildenburg complained to Roller about the general darkness onstage in his designs for *Die Walküre*. As a singer and actor, she argued that the darkness hindered her onstage performance and confused the audience as they hopelessly sought to discern stage action.

Reaction to Roller's visual style varied greatly, although even those who criticized the visuals as too overpowering praised their brilliance. Wagner's son Siegfried and the architect Adolf Loos felt that Roller's staging diverted audience attention from the music too strongly. For Siegfried, his father's naturalistic sets were most appropriate for this introspective work. Mahler, according to Roller, believed that the music should always remain in the foreground of the audience's perception. He nevertheless praised Roller's visual conception of *Tristan*, demonstrating a more fully-developed view of the *Gesamtkunstwerk* than that of Wagner himself, who promoted the idea of an equal collaboration of many arts but favored musical expression above all.

“The Sound of the Present-Day Prepared Piano”
Tina Huettenrauch (Louisiana State University)

The performance of John Cage’s pieces for prepared piano presents a major challenge to the artist. Cage’s tables of preparations are often non-specific and inconclusive with regard to the appropriate objects one should choose. Using as an example Cage’s *Sonatas and Interludes*, this paper attempts to show how the timbre of the instrument has changed significantly from its introduction in 1940 to today and tries to discern what factors are responsible in inducing these changes.

I chose three recordings of the piece, the original 1951 recording by Ajemian, Nigel Butterley 1992, and Boris Berman 1998, focusing on pieces with metal preparations (nuts, screws, and bolts) as these are easier to distinguish and classify according to the sound they create. The most significant finding was that the rendition by Ajemian is significantly lower in overall pitch than the two more recent recordings.

In *The Well Prepared Piano* (1973), Richard Bunker relates the changes in pitch to changes in object mass, placement, and exerted string tension. Based on his comment, I prepared a piano for Sonata VII—a piece that predominantly uses notes prepared with fasteners—several times using different materials, including one stainless steel and several zinc-plated wood screws, and sheet metal and machine screws of various sizes. The most significant changes in sound production resulted not from the material itself, but from differences in diameter and mass, as is consistent with suggestions by Bunker.

Yet even when using material in close accord with Bunker’s specifications, the overall sound remained higher in pitch. I believe the difference is due to changes in the American steel trade industry over the last fifty years. In the 1980s, the U.S. switched from largely exporting to largely importing steel. As a result, increasing amounts of low quality raw materials, so called pig irons, have entered the American market. These materials contain much higher carbon percentages and are thus more brittle (Krauss, *Steels: Processing, Structure, and Performance*, 2005); this implies that they form fasteners lower in mass, density, and resistance to stress. Because object mass is one of the most important factors in determining the sound of the prepared piano, this presents a major challenge for today’s performance of Cage’s pieces. In addition to size and placement of the object, one must now also consider the metal composition of the material used for preparation. The paper will illustrate the changes of physical properties in modern day fasteners and will demonstrate the changes in sound using both commercial and experimental recordings.

“The Performance Tradition of Berio’s *Circles*”
Amy Strickland (University of Alabama)

Luciano Berio’s reputation as one of the foremost composers of the postwar avant garde goes uncontested, but it is unclear that any of his works has established a clear performance practice tradition. My paper addresses the difficulties of constructing such a performance practice tradition for *Circles* by examining the relevant available materials: the score, identical in the two existing editions (Universal Edition and Harcourt Brace); commercial recordings of Cathy Berberian (for whom the work was written), and Christine Schadeberg, and two archive recordings by Jennifer Goltz (generously provided by the soloist); the composer’s comments; and scholars’ observations.

I will discuss the information provided by these sources, evaluate their relative degrees of authority, and explain the difficulties of reconciling the differences among them. For instance, on the third page of the fourth movement, “riverly is a flower,” the unfamiliar layout of the page—including the placement of sections of the text in the instrumentalists’ parts—has resulted in two drastically differing interpretations of Berio’s notation. In one, the soprano sings and/or speaks all of the words, including those in the boxes above and below her line; in the other, she performs *only* the words that are set to notes on her line, while the instrumentalists speak or sing the words that lie in their parts on the page. The first interpretation is supported by recordings of Berberian, Schadeberg, and one of Goltz’s (under Berio’s direction at the 1999 Salzburg Festival); the second by the research of noted Berio scholar David Osmond-Smith and by Goltz’s other performance. Because both interpretations have authority, a performer of *Circles* must decide which best fits her own reading of this confusingly notated passage.

The difficulties encountered in determining the “correct” way to perform this page highlight a number of problems inherent in defining a performance practice for modern works in general and for this work in particular: the ambiguity of the score, differences between “definitive” performances, and Berio’s evident (and perhaps unsurprising) change in attitude toward his own work over a forty-year period.

Finally, I will offer my perspective on how each of the two interpretations of this passage may succeed in communicating the underlying message of *Circles*: the changing relationships between word and music, between singer

and instruments. This message echoes the changing relationship of performer, composer, and score in many modern works, an evolution that spurs the research and debate which serve to keep these compositions alive.

Friday 1:30–2:30 • Taking a Second Look

Gregory W. Harwood (Georgia Southern University), Chair

“A Reappraisal of Bertali’s Instrumental Compositions”

Charles E. Brewer (Florida State University)

In the preface to his *Composizioni musicali* (1645), Giovanni Antonio Bertoli called his contemporary Antonio Bertali (1605-1669) “valoroso nel violino” (skilled on the violin). Yet in most modern studies the emphasis has been on the many operas Bertali composed for the Viennese court rather than those instrumental works that seem to have been highly esteemed by his contemporaries and colleagues. Earlier critical examinations of the Baroque sonata by Newman and Apel relied heavily on the two collections of sonatas entitled *Prothemia suavissima* (1672), even though the title page only ascribed these works to “J. S. A. B.” and Brossard, who owned the only preserved copies, had suggested they included works by Bertali and other composers. This presentation will present a new examination of the varieties and styles of Bertali’s instrumental works based upon all the currently known compositions and also reexamine the significance of these works within the context of instrumental music in central Europe during the mid-seventeenth century.

Until recently, the twenty-nine instrumental compositions (primarily sonatas) found in manuscripts stemming from Sweden, Alsace, central Germany, Austria, and especially Moravia, that could be firmly ascribed to Bertali were rarely examined, with the notable exception of Zink’s 1989 dissertation on the large-ensemble sonatas. To these can now be added thirteen more compositions from Jacob Ludwig’s “*Partitur Buch*” (Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, Cod. Guelf. 34.7 Aug. 2o), dated 1662. Though this extensive anthology of Baroque instrumental music was first brought to light in 1995, it is remarkable that further scholarly studies have not appeared in the intervening years. The previously unknown compositions by Bertali in this source include two solo violin sonatas, what is most likely an earlier version of his modulating *Ciaccona*, three sonatas à 2, one canzona and one sonata à 3, one sonata à 4, two sonatas à 5, and two sonatas à 6, making this manuscript the largest single collection outside of the Krom□□□ archives for works by Bertali. It also appears that the “*Partitur Buch*” is the earliest extant source for any of the instrumental works of Bertali.

First of all, a reexamination of Bertali’s works provides evidence—most especially in his three solo sonatas and his *Ciaccona*—for his significance as a virtuoso violinist in the first half of the seventeenth century. Earlier authors had speculated on Bertali’s possible role as teacher to composers such as Löwe, Schmelzer, and Biber, and these works now provide concrete evidence of stylistic continuity with the music by his supposed pupils. Secondly, these works establish Bertali’s importance in the establishment of a “Hapsburg” compositional style in the sonata, emphasizing the use of counterpoint and imitation within the context of the *stylus fantasticus* as described by Kircher. Finally, the critical examination of these works demonstrates that Bertali may have had a significant impact on the compositional style of instrumental music in northern Europe, for example on the works of Nicolai, Pohl, and Buxtehude.

“With all Pomposity and Solemnity?: Music, Ritual and the Reevaluation
of Baroque Aesthetics in Religious Culture of New Spain”

Jesús A. Ramos-Kittrell (New College of Florida)

The explosion of research on sacred music from the New World has consistently stressed the grandeur of performance practices at the Cathedral of Mexico City. These studies have invariably promoted the notion that, due to the quality of European repertory and the sheer talent of local musicians, religious life in New Spain was part of a Baroque culture striving for excess and exuberance in ritual performance. Such studies, however, have ignored the social dynamics embedded in colonial religious practices. Fully neglected, despite its historical importance, the Divine Office remains an unexplored cultural landscape of musical practices. There is no arena that better embodies the paradoxical development of religious culture in New Spain, both in its stable consistency and its regional diversity. The analysis of important social and religious festivities such as the Feast of Corpus Christi illustrates how a series of political and economic factors profoundly affected the observance of ritual performance in New Spain, of which music was a central element.

Recent archival research shows that, far from magnificent, religious feasts during the eighteenth century were dearly impacted by political and economical forces surrounding the Metropolitan See. The celebration of ritual and ceremony depended on funds available for production, and in the case of Mexico City Cathedral these were derived from three sources: collection of tithes, investments on real estate, and private endowments for special festivities.

Problems in the internal economy of the Cathedral, however, accentuated a recession that affected religious celebrations. Frictions with the king's royal assembly caused the withholding of funds belonging to the church. Moreover, the partial downfall of the city's economy caused the devaluation of agricultural goods, thus diminishing revenue from tithes. The necessity to cover salaries for singers, musicians and priests, plus the debts incurred by a poor administration of internal capital, forced the Cathedral to use funds from private endowments originally allocated for the celebration of important feasts during the Corpus Christi octave, thereby jeopardizing the celebration of rituals for the Holy Sacrament as well as other saints and martyrs. As a result, rituals during the Corpus octave became acts of voluntary attendance in which the choir and celebrating priests did not receive payment for some of the most important ceremonies, such as the Corpus Christi matins office. In some cases, the deteriorated finances forced the Cathedral to cancel certain rituals during the octave, such as the Mass for the Renovation of the Holy Sacrament and requiem services.

This paper will ultimately prompt scholars to reevaluate notions of excess and exuberance characteristic of Baroque religious culture in New Spain. Uncovered archival information allows us to derive a critical contextual assessment for the performance of sacred music as part of ritual and ceremony at the Cathedral of Mexico City. In light of new evidence, I will argue that the imagined splendor and magnificence of religious practices in New Spain has fallen short from an earnest appraisal of historical fact.

Friday 2:35–3:35 • Italian Opera: Behind the Scenes
Scott Warfield (University of Central Florida), Chair

“Vicente Martín y Soler’s Operas for Turin: Elements of Production
and Ensemble Writing in *Andromaca* (1780) and *Vologeso* (1783)”
Margaret R. Butler (University of Alabama)

In the early 1780s Vicente Martín y Soler composed two opere serie for Turin’s Teatro Regio: *Andromaca* and *Vologeso*. Perhaps because scholarly attention has been largely focused on the composer’s popular and influential Viennese opere buffe, these earlier works have remained unexplored. They exemplify not only distinct characteristics of Turinese operatic style but important aspects of Martín’s developing compositional language as well.

Andromaca and *Vologeso* share intriguing features. Both operas are based on preexisting librettos with qualities that made them attractive to Turinese audiences. Comparison of the 1780s librettos with multiple versions previously set in Turin and elsewhere reveals that those set by Martín exhibit modernizing structural changes while maintaining stylistic continuity. The two operas employed the same prima donna, Portuguese mezzo-soprano Luigia Todi. The Teatro Regio’s established hiring practices suggest that Todi likely influenced the composer’s return to Turin for *Vologeso* after his success with *Andromaca*. Extramusical factors such as the terms of the composer’s engagement, the time frame for the works’ completion, the chronology of the hiring of personnel, and the production and rehearsal schedule had implications for the music and contribute to a broad perspective on the works’ composition and performance. Other evidence indicates the certain growth in Martín’s success in Turin from one opera to the next, an element in his burgeoning international reputation around this time. Martín composed duets in both operas and a trio in *Vologeso*. These ensembles demonstrate the composer’s skill in writing for multiple voices and point to some features that were to become hallmarks of his later style. They also illustrate aspects of the structural complexity and textural variety characteristic of late eighteenth-century ensembles, well understood in opera buffa but less thoroughly examined in opera seria.

Archival material produced by the Teatro Regio’s administrative directors illuminates the production practices that influenced Martín’s Turinese opere serie. Exploring this material together with manuscript scores produced by the theater’s copyists and printed librettos helps establish a context for the composer’s early works and contributes to a more complete understanding of late-eighteenth century opera seria.

“New Letters from Scribe to Verdi and the ‘Problem’ of the Fifth Act of *Les Vêpres siciliennes*”
Andreas Giger (Louisiana State University)

In 1978, Andrew Porter published a collection of fourteen letters from Verdi to Scribe that have fundamentally changed our understanding of Verdi’s role in crafting the libretto of *Les Vêpres siciliennes*. While we originally thought that Verdi had more or less accepted Scribe’s libretto without reservations, we now know that he influenced every aspect from dramaturgy to versification. But so far, we have known only Verdi’s side of the correspondence, even if we have assumed that Scribe’s side would eventually be found at the Verdi villa in Sant’Agata. With regard to five letters, I have

now been able to confirm this assumption: they are indeed at Sant'Agata and can be consulted in a microfilm copy at New York University's American Institute for Verdi Studies.

The five letters do not change our picture of a composer actively involved in crafting the libretto, but they do change the picture of the ostensibly uncooperative librettist. And if Scribe did indeed fulfill Verdi's wishes better than we have so far believed, we must assume that the result reflects Verdi's intentions. The fifth act, for instance, which Scribe upon Verdi's request had revised repeatedly and which musicological studies generally consider to be problematic, might in fact have pleased Verdi. Based on the newly discovered and previously published letters, an analysis of the dramaturgy, the reviews of the Paris premiere, and an unknown letter Verdi wrote to the editor of *L'Europe artiste* in defense of his good relations with Scribe, this paper will show that the ceremonial opening of act 5 does indeed reflect a convincing concept.

The act begins with a chorus and two arias, all ceremonial in nature. The slow dramatic pace does not—as Anselm Gerhard claims—constitute a problem but reflects a clear intention: Verdi had Scribe remove any trace of ominous foreboding (clearly present in Scribe's original conception) and replace it by lighthearted numbers characterized by mechanical scanning (often against prosodic accents) and then accelerate the dramatic pace toward the tragic end. Not only does this concept duplicate a successful precedent (the second half of act 2 of *La traviata*, where the ceremonial matador and gypsy choruses, via a dramatic acceleration lead to Alfredo's insult of Violetta), but it has a precedent in act 1 of Meyerbeer's *Les Huguenots*. One French critic praised precisely this dramatic layout, while others, including Paul Scudo (who normally was ill inclined toward Verdi's operas) considered two of the three numbers of the ceremonial opening to be among the opera's best.

Friday 3:55–4:55 • Musical Manifestations of Britain's Heroes

Valerie Goertzen (Loyola University), Chair

“Dryden's *King Arthur* on the Opera Stage”

Lisi Oliver (Louisiana State University)

One of the founding works for the English opera stage is *King Arthur, or The British Worthy*, a text written by John Dryden for which Henry Purcell supplied the music. As musical theater was finding in Purcell's melodies a unique musical voice and style that would define this new British genre, so it sought in Dryden's text a corresponding Britishness of subject matter. (This, for example, is the first musical work to employ the term “Britannia,” more famous musically in “Rule Britannia,” the finale to Thomas Arne's later masque, *King Arthur*, similarly based on an early medieval theme.) Thus the beginnings of English opera are inextricably intertwined with emergent nationalism, drawing on both the historical and literary past of the early British Isles.

Most of the material in Dryden's drama is fanciful, despite his claim to have drawn his material “out of Beda, Bochartus, and other Authors.” There is, in fact, very little of Bede; however, Dryden does seem to have employed information gleaned from “other authors,” notably Geoffrey of Monmouth and/or his followers. But Dryden goes farther than mere appropriation of earlier material in his unification of the Celtic and Anglo-Saxon past to create a foundation for the concept of a unified nation. This paper examines the historical and literary sources of the libretto to Purcell's *King Arthur*, how they are employed in the musical presentation, and how this lays the base for a united Britannia.

“Vaughan Williams's *Scott of the Antarctic* and *Sinfonia Antartica*: A Problem of Ambiguity”

Aaron Keebaugh (University of Florida)

In 1948, Ealing Studios commissioned Vaughan Williams to compose music for the British film *Scott of the Antarctic*, an imperialistic endeavor drawing from the story of Robert Falcon Scott's fateful expedition to the South Pole in 1912. Deeply moved by Scott's demise, the composer later transformed his film score into his seventh symphony, *Sinfonia Antartica*, in 1953.

Since Scott's death in Antarctica over ninety years ago, questions about his competence as an able explorer have surfaced in various historical accounts. Historian Roland Huntford, for example, offered scathing criticism about Scott's leadership abilities in his book *The Last Place on Earth* (1980). Yet Susan Solomon's recent study, *The Coldest March: Scott's Fatal Antarctic Expedition* (2001), defended the Polar explorer, citing that terrible weather conditions brought about the demise of Scott and his companions. Recent musicological research has viewed Scott's blundering, or tragic, end through the eyes of Ralph Vaughan Williams. Michael Beckerman has claimed that the composer harbored ambiguous feelings about Scott as a competent explorer because the respective endings of the film and symphony are drastically different.

But careful reconsideration of the facts involved in the compositional processes of both works yields a new view. Drawing from personal correspondence between Vaughan Williams and Ernest Irving, musical director for Ealing Studios, and interpretation of the symphony and film score, based on archival materials in the Ralph Vaughan Williams Collection at the British Library, this writer argues that Vaughan Williams held a critical view of Scott as an able Polar explorer. The fact that less than half of the composer's original score was used in the film indicates that other minds were active in shaping the film production. And given that Michael Balcon, producer of *Scott of the Antarctic*, sought to praise the Polar explorer in the film, Vaughan Williams's role in the ideological portrayal of Scott was secondary at best. The composer's need to express *his* view of the Scott story spurred him into a project where he made the final decisions. Thus, the author argues that *Sinfonia Antartica* stands as Vaughan Williams's personal interpretation of the final journey of Robert Falcon Scott, twentieth-century Britain's so-called hero.

Friday 5:00–6:00 • Local Colors: Two Views from California

Douglass Seaton (Florida State University), Chair

“Ernest Bloch in San Francisco”

David Z. Kushner (University of Florida)

After five tumultuous years as founding director, teacher, and administrator at the Cleveland Institute of Music (1920–1925), Ernest Bloch found a more congenial home as Artistic Director of the fledgling San Francisco Conservatory of Music, a position he held from 1926–1930. In this environment, freed from the tyranny of administrative work (including fundraising), he did some teaching, and, most importantly, composed three award-winning works, *Four Episodes* for chamber ensemble, *America*, and *Helvetia*. This paper focuses on the circumstances surrounding the composition of each composition, the content of the music, and the varied reactions to them by critics and the general public. Venues for research included the Ernest Bloch Collection in the Library of Congress and the Ernest Bloch Archive at the University of California at Berkeley.

The San Francisco works were the recipients of significant prizes for composition: *Four Episodes*, scored for string quintet, piano, flute, oboe, bassoon, and French horn, garnered the Carolyn Beebe Prize of the New York Chamber Music Society (\$1000); *America*, a programmatic symphony with a closing choral anthem, captured the \$3000 prize offered by *Musical America*; and *Helvetia*, a one-movement symphonic fresco with five sections, shared the \$25,000 prize provided by the RCA Victor Company with four other compositions (two by Robert Russell Bennett, and one each by Louis Gruenberg and Aaron Copland).

During the course of the paper, the referential aspects of the three works under examination will be discussed in light of the specificity of the cultures and locales they represent: *Four Episodes*—San Francisco, and, in particular, its Chinese Theater; *America*—the United States, and, in particular, the eras covering the landing of the Pilgrims, the Civil War, and the 1920s (Bloch became a naturalized citizen in 1924); *Helvetia*—Switzerland, the composer's country of birth, with attention to both the German and French cultures of that land. Live and recorded performances will be included in the presentation.

The San Francisco works reveal a Bloch far removed from his grand, epic “Jewish Cycle.” In this west coast haven, he unveils a far different approach to nationalism, one wherein he makes an unapologetic direct appeal to “the people.” Original manuscripts, published scores, and letters to and from the composer have enabled the author to assess these creations in the context of Bloch's total oeuvre, and to suggest how they are likely to be viewed from the vantage point of retrospection.

“Perspectives on Jim Morrison from the Underground: Jim Morrison and the *Los Angeles Free Press*”

Melissa Ursula Dawn Goldsmith (Nicholls State University)

How did the *Los Angeles Free Press*, the largest circulating underground newspaper in the history of journalism, impart a record of Jim Morrison's milieu and the rise of the poet-singer who fronted The Doors? Morrison's cult continues today, through pilgrimages to his grave (a major tourist attraction in Paris), many fans, Oliver Stone's film *The Doors* (1991), videos broadcast on the Internet via *YouTube*, rediscoveries of recordings, and new discoveries of unreleased recordings, lost films, and unpublished manuscripts of Morrison's poetry. How did the *L.A. Free Press* contribute to Morrison's images, legends, and myths? This presentation will explore the relationship and exchanges between Morrison and the *L.A. Free Press*, examining local perspectives on Morrison's milieu, the counterculture of Los Angeles, the city he loved.

Wallace Fowlie discussed the influence of Rimbaud on Morrison's life, songs, and poems in *Rimbaud and Jim Morrison: The Rebel as Poet* (1993). He also described Morrison's other influences—theatrical, philosophical, mythological, and literary, tracing the influence of Antonin Artaud, Nietzsche, Joseph Campbell, and Beat poets like Kerouac. Although Fowlie mentioned contemporary countercultural influences on Morrison, he did so in less detail, usually to draw connections between Rimbaud and Morrison as rebel artists. In their biography *No One Here Gets Out Alive* (1980) music journalist Jerry Hopkins and Morrison's past protégé Danny Sugerman provided a bibliography that contained several *L.A. Free Press* articles and reviews. Sugerman worked as an assistant in the publicity office; he later became a promoter for The Doors and after Morrison's death in 1971 a manager for keyboardist Ray Manzarek. In his autobiography *Wonderland Avenue: Tales of Glamour and Excess* (1989) Sugerman explained that staff members of the *L.A. Free Press* socialized with members of the band by attending both press and private parties.

There has also been a steady stream of biographies of Morrison since his death, some more reliable than others, but none has surveyed the *L.A. Free Press* literature or considered its impact on Morrison himself and viewpoints of him during life and after his death. The *L.A. Free Press* gave many accounts of Doors concerts as well as advertisements for their concerts, criticism, reviews, and interviews. It also contained poems, leftist views of news, columns about politics as well as opinions about art, literature, music, and theatre, and advertisements for events that appear to have had a significant influence on Morrison's artistic and literary interests, aesthetics, and creative output. This presentation provides new avenues for analyzing Morrison's songs and poems and their history. For example, the song "The End" is an heir to poems with oedipal themes, but it also echoes the anti-Vietnam sentiments of letters and articles as well as the "hate poetry" by Beat poets and others that appeared in the *L.A. Free Press*. The song "Not to Touch the Earth," in addition to its influence by William Blake and sitar music made popular by Ravi Shankar, shares this connection to the *L.A. Free Press* with "The End."

Saturday 9:30–11:00 • Local Colors: Putting Music in Its Place

David Z. Kushner (University of Florida), Chair

"Pilgrim's Pride?: Edgar Stillman Kelley's 'New England' Symphony (1913)"

Charles Freeman (Palm Beach Atlantic University)

The "New England" Symphony of Edgar Stillman Kelley (1857–1944) is unusual for its overt invocation of a particular national and regional identity: Kelley typically avoided such associations in his works, like his American Romantic contemporary Edward MacDowell and unlike other contemporaries such as George Chadwick or Amy Beach. Of Kelley's previous works, only the symphonic suite *Aladdin*, an exercise in exoticism based on the composer's experiences in San Francisco's Chinatown, suggest any sort of regional identification.

The symphony's movements are preceded by quotations from the log book of the Pilgrim's ship, the *Mayflower*, by Gov. William Bradford, an ancestor of the composer. Despite the composer's stated aim to evoke "certain phases of thought and sentiment" of the Pilgrims as suggested by the Bradford quotations, rather than specific places or events, Kelley also uses two very specific regional identifiers in the composition of his symphony. The second movement uses examples of bird song collected in New England by the composer, while the third movement quotes a "New England Hymn" by composer Timothy Swan (1758–1842). Both of these devices would be used by later composers: Olivier Messiaen made frequent and celebrated use of birdsong, and American composers would rediscover New England hymnody as source material, most famously William Schuman with his appropriation of tunes by William Billings in his *New England Triptych*. Swan's anachronistic but regionally appropriate hymn tune, CHINA, gained currency in nineteenth-century New England due to its frequent use at funerals, an association that reinforces the log book quotation appended to the movement, "Great lamentations and heaviness."

The symphony was heard in Germany in April 1914, only a few months before World War I, which would sour U.S.-German relations and help sweep aside Kelley's generation of American composers. Its publication in 1915, in an edition both in English and German, reveals the dual nature of Kelley's expressive impulse: an American musical statement within the context of a European musical style. This dual impulse is reinforced by two aspects of the publication: the support of the Stillman Kelley Publication Society, consisting of both American patrons and German musical figures, and Kelley's commentary on the Swan hymn tune, in which he enumerates its musical virtues and declares it "worthy to rank with the German chorales." The symphony's Romantic musical language and use of nature sounds and quoted material make the "New England" Symphony an unusual hybrid of older and innovative musical techniques as well as a potential worldwide assertion of a particular American Romantic identity, one which would be short-circuited by changing musical tastes and ideologies.

“After the Show: The Intimate Revue in London’s West End from 1945 to 1955”
Rebecca Burkart (North Florida Community College)

Great Britain has a long history of popular musical entertainment. This paper will trace the history of one type of show, the intimate revue, which grew out of the nineteenth-century London Music Hall. It featured a great variety of acts including the stand-up comedy and popular songs that would become a part of the later genre.

The first musical revues in the 1920s and 30s, with fast moving and topical fare, became very popular with the middle and upper classes. There was not really a plot as in a musical, but just witty sketches and songs interspersed with dances. The big revues were written and produced by men such as Andre Charlot and Noel Coward.

After World War II musical revues became lighter and wittier, the cast was much smaller, and the topics had become more satirical. These revues have not previously been researched and will be described in some detail in this paper. The venues for the post-war intimate revues were small, private theaters in London’s West End originally meant for productions of plays. Some of the large theaters had been bombed during the war and never reopened, but even those that remained open had become so costly that to start new shows was prohibitive. Producers turned to the small clubs to present new plays and to avoid the censors. Private clubs with a fairly cheap yearly subscription could bypass the censors because they were ostensibly not open to the general public. It was found that the income generated by the intimate revues helped finance these plays.

This paper will describe the contents of a typical intimate revue from the 1940s and 50s. The intimate revue began after the play and started around midnight. These shows consisted of sketches and songs, with songs sometimes making up nearly the entire show. Most revues included sentimental songs, “point” songs, period pieces, blackout and closing songs. One of the best writers for these intimate revues was Peter Myers. His shows with such non-descriptive titles as “After the Show” and “The Irving Revue” had songs composed by Norman Dannatt and others. Some of Mr. Dannatt’s songs with words by Peter Myers have been recently unearthed and will be described as part of a typical intimate revue.

The writer will also show that the type of people who traditionally attended the intimate revues in the 1940s and 50s were different from those who attended the revues in the 1920s. The audience for these later intimate revues was the intellectual middle class who liked to ridicule the government and the aristocracy. The topical sketches and songs of the revues appealed to this new type of audience. Although these intimate revues were not as satirical and political as later shows like *Beyond the Fringe* and the televised *That Was the Week That Was*, this writer will show how they led the way for these later shows.

“Music in the New Orleans Diaspora”
Stella Baty Landis (Tulane University)

New Orleans music—both within and outside the city itself—has changed. Immediately following Hurricane Katrina, the dispersal of New Orleans musicians across the United States introduced local musical idioms into new urban contexts. In the months since the storm, some musicians have returned home to find a different city and a different environment for music; others have stayed away and started developing new audiences in new settings. In both cases, the music that always has served as such a powerful signifier for the specific place that *was* New Orleans has, like that former city, been stored away in history, and new sounds have emerged from its traces. This new musical reality has been discussed in articles and interviews in the popular media, and in documentary films such as *New Orleans Music in Exile* (Robert Mugge, 2006) and *When the Levees Broke* (Spike Lee, 2006). It is the purpose of the present study to summon the discussion into a scholarly realm.

In a course titled “Music in the New Orleans Diaspora,” offered during the fall 2006 semester at Tulane University, I asked students to investigate how the new realities following August 2005 are affecting specific New Orleans musicians. These students’ findings revealed a range of emotional and musical responses to the Diaspora. In written reports, the students have contributed to the necessary documentation of this critical turning point in New Orleans—and thus American—music culture. This paper will present the findings of my students, along with my own research into musicians in New Orleans and elsewhere, in order to keep this documentation current and accessible to the scholarly community.

Saturday 11:15–1:15 • Thinking Classically: Structure and Kinship
Jan Herlinger (Louisiana State University), Chair

“Formal Innovation in Haydn’s Mature Piano Trios (Hob. XV: 5–32)”

Haydn's piano trios, virtually ignored through all of the nineteenth century and most of the twentieth century (with the exception of an occasional sympathetic observer, such as Donald Francis Tovey), have undergone a major rehabilitation in recent decades. The reputation of the trios began to rise with Charles Rosen's glowing commentary in *The Classical Style* (351). After describing them as "a third great set of works to set beside the symphonies and the quartets," and remarking on their innovation and feeling of relaxed improvisation, he concludes by stating, "It is odd to have to defend some of the greatest music ever written" (*The Classical Style*, 354; Rosen was trying to reconcile the trios' relative neglect to that point with their obvious musical merits). Since then, H.C. Robbins Landon has discussed the piano trios at length (*Haydn, Chronicle and Works*, volumes 4 and 5), and W. Dean Sutcliffe has explored their textural features, both in his dissertation and in two recent articles drawn from it ("Haydn's Piano Trio Textures" and "The Haydn Piano Trio: Textual Facts and Textual Principles"). All of these authors express their admiration of these fine compositions, while at the same time, leaving many additional avenues for further exploration.

This study seeks to focus on the mature trios' formal variety. By the mid-1780s, Haydn's use of the four-movement form for symphonies and string quartets left little room for formal experimentation. The occasional reversal of the minuet and slow movement, or, less often, the reversal of the first two movements as a *sonata da chiesa* throwback ("The Razor" Quartet, Opus 55, no. 1), and a singular example of a slow finale (C major quartet, Opus 54, no. 1) were about the extent of his formal experimentation in these genres by this time. However, the intimate, more loosely structured piano trio genre, with its lower, flexible number of movements (two- and three-movement works exclusively) seemed to inspire Haydn to an unprecedented degree of formal variety, working hand-in-hand with some of his most revolutionary tonal ideas.

I will identify some formal models for both the two- and three-movement piano trios, tracing them back to experimental designs from his earlier string trios and baryton trios (written ca. 1765–1776) and his middle-period keyboard sonatas (Landon #19–56, written ca. 1765–1784). The latter works include what László Somfai describes as the three-movement *concert-style sonata*, the two-movement *chamber sonata* and the three-movement *court-style sonata*, exemplified by the Esterházy set of 1773, the *dilettante-style sonatas* of the 1776 set and the *dilettante sonatas in concertante style*, exemplified by the Auenbrugger Sonatas of 1780 (*The Keyboard Sonatas of Joseph Haydn*, 175–77). Haydn continues this formal variety in his late piano trios: along with the "standard" fast-slow-fast three-movement model, Haydn used three additional three-movement designs and four other two-movement designs (two of them a single time) in the mature trios. This study will explore the development of each formal model and their interrelation.

"A Reevaluation of "Significant" Thematic Relationships in the Classical Era"
Bryan Proksch (McNeese State University)

Thematic resemblance, an affinity between two ostensibly different themes, has played an important role in fostering a sense of cyclic integration among the movements of a musical work, beginning with the first cyclic masses and continuing to the present. Yet the evaluation and relevance of such connections in the music of the late eighteenth century has been debated since E.T.A. Hoffmann published his review of Beethoven's Fifth Symphony in 1810. Hoffmann touted Beethoven's treatment of thematic material across movements as superior to that of Haydn and Mozart. Later writers have followed his lead to the point where the very presence of thematic relationships in late eighteenth-century music has been seriously questioned. In his 1962 article "Significant and Coincidental Resemblance between Classical Themes," Jan LaRue placed such a high standard of evaluation on thematic resemblance as to deny virtually all connections as "insignificant." While James Webster and Ethan Haimo have since demonstrated the occasional presence of thematic connections in the music of Haydn, most analyses written in the past decade continue to avoid the issue.

This paper will reevaluate the benefits and problems inherent in the evaluation of thematic resemblances in the hopes of changing the ways in which they are analyzed. Connections typically have been tagged with the binary opposites of "present" or "absent" despite the fact that not all connections are equally strong. This mindset often produces unconvincing "extremist" arguments (e.g. "hidden" motives or similarities of a single interval), as confidence in the success of one clear-cut analysis leads to over-confidence in other analyses. I will argue that thematic resemblance must be evaluated on a work-by-work basis: one work's strong connections have no bearing on a weak connection in a separate work. Furthermore, connections can be of any degree of strength, from insignificant to somewhat strong, to very strong. This framework avoids present/absent mentality so often seen in thematic analysis and helps curb the tendency to make overly ambitious arguments. Context rather than the pitches themselves play a crucial role in my approach. When analysts speak of a thematic resemblance in the late eighteenth century, their connections are often

rooted in a convergence of similar non-thematic elements (texture, harmony, form, phrase structure, rhythm, etc.) with a relatively weak thematic component.

Haydn's Symphony No. 49 in F minor will serve as my case study in the issues of thematic resemblance. Some have argued that the openings of each movement of this work use the same basic motive while others have questioned the connection. The reception history of late eighteenth-century thematic resemblance, the all-or-nothing approach to connections, and the purely thematic nature of many analyses have been decisive factors in the positions taken. The debate has been all the more problematic because this work has been used as the justification for far less convincing analyses of other works by Haydn. By evaluating thematic resemblances within a continuum and as part of a larger musical context, a more balanced, useful, and convincing analysis is possible.

"Beethoven Thinking About Cycles: Some Consequences"
Joanna Cobb Biermann (University of Alabama)

In the course of his compositional life, Beethoven repeatedly grouped smaller works of a genre such as songs or small piano pieces into larger units for publication, often lavishing great care on their orderings, even when the resulting groupings were not intended to be performed at one time. This paper explores the diverse nature of some of these gatherings: first the *Gellert-Lieder*, Op. 48, a group of works not originally conceived as a cyclical grouping but which the author shows that Beethoven, after deciding to publish the six works in hand, ordered and reordered before, during and even after their original publication and made into something much more than a mere collection. These are compared with the later group of songs, *An die ferne Geliebte*, Op. 98, which were conceived as an extremely cohesive unit, a work which is generally considered to be the first song cycle. Op. 119, the final set of pieces to be considered here, is actually made up of two groups of bagatelles of disparate origins. Barry Cooper has shown that they stem from works conceived over Beethoven's whole lifetime, from his early days in Bonn to shortly before the time of their publication. The older pieces were not only reordered, but—unlike the Gellert songs, which the composer was able to bind together effectively by creating an overarching intellectual framework—partially rewritten using typical late-period devices to make of them a more unified whole.

"Franz Schubert, Caspar David Friedrich, and the Impossible Landscape"
Edward Hafer (University of Southern Mississippi)

Robert Schumann, speaking through his alter ego, Florestan, once declared that "the aesthetic of one art is that of the others, only the material is different." Indeed, early nineteenth-century parallels between music, painting, and literature ran deep. In the visual arts, newly-ennobled Romantic landscape paintings provided a canvas for the recurring themes that defined the period. No longer purely decorative, these scenes embraced a full range of emotions and assumed forms that transcended the images they sought to represent. Nature became a mirror and a lamp, reflecting man's earthly life and illuminating an infinite realm where one could seek comfort and fulfillment. The same dichotomy of real and imagined worlds formed the essence of a significant body of Schubert's *Lieder*.

The kinship of music and painting invites systematic comparison. In particular, nineteenth-century writings suggest close parallels between the music of Schubert and the paintings of his northern contemporary, Caspar David Friedrich. The objective of this essay, then, is three-fold: to establish criteria for comparing music and landscape painting based on period criticism; to demonstrate aesthetic connections between Friedrich's *Cross in the Mountains* and Schubert's "Frühlingstraum" from *Winterreise*; and to discuss ways in which Schubert's "Die Stadt" and "Der Doppelgänger" from the *Heine Lieder* manipulate formal and tonal conventions to create "musical" landscapes that evoke the static timelessness of Friedrich's paintings.

Although music is a temporal art and landscape painting is fixed in time and space, writers have discussed them similarly. In a series of scathing commentaries on Friedrich's *Cross in the Mountains*, Freiherr von Ramdohr outlined a number of ways in which the artist violated conventions of classical landscape painting by ignoring laws of perspective through his unusual arrangement of objects in the scene and his use of prominent light sources in unnatural—even impossible—ways. A decade later, a reviewer similarly criticized Schubert for abrupt shifts of sound that violated the rules of conventional harmonic practice. For Schubert and Friedrich, startling juxtapositions of unlike perspectives form the basis of much of their art. Such sudden shifts characterize the structure of "Frühlingstraum," a song in which the wanderer-protagonist vacillates between dream states and reality, announced by radical changes of tonality, texture, and mood. In addition to these perspectival shifts, music and painting can be compared in terms of the artists' use of color, subject matter, and content—issues that figure prominently in Schubert's late *Lieder*.

Having established these criteria, I will examine the striking formal structures of “Die Stadt” and “Der Doppelgänger,” songs whose unusual accompanimental figures and areas of tonal ambiguity become a metaphor for static contemplation, inviting the beholder to study the music as a fixed entity, just as one would gaze at a painting. By considering music and painting as sister arts that place similar demands on the beholder, one can gain an enhanced understanding of some of Schubert’s music that resists traditional analysis.